

**TOWN OF CARLISLE  
HISTORICAL COMMISSION  
Minutes**

**Wednesday, June 16, 2021  
7:00 pm at Town Hall**

**Members Present:**

Kathy Keller, Co-Chair, Annette Lee Co-Chair, Edward Rolfe

**Members Absent:**

Eric Adams, Geoff Freeman

**Alternates Present**

Jack O'Connor, Chip Dewing

**Others Present:**

Allison Casazza, Brian Waterson and Jenn Kaczenski; Shelley Dweck and Ted Van Valey; and Julie MacQueen

**7:00 pm Call to Order by Kathy Keller, Co-Chair.**

**Informational Meeting to discuss Castle Playground Project**

Brian Waterson (Chair, Castle Playground Project Committee and Co-Chair of School Advisory Council) and Jenn Kaczenski (School Advisory Committee, and Chair of Grants and Fundraising for the playground project) presented an overview of the playground initiative at the Carlisle Public Schools. The Carlisle Castle Playground was built in 1988 as a community-build effort with the expectation that it would survive for 20-25 years. Although it has survived for over thirty years, the timber structure has degraded, it is not ADA compliant, and does not meet current safety guidelines. Accessibility guidelines have changed considerably since the 1980s so they must be considered as part of the playground rebuild.

This will be a community led and funded effort. It will take time to raise money through grants, corporate fundraising, and from the community. The project will be done in four phases: Discovery, Design, Approve, and Build. The Committee is in the Design phase now and is formalizing their processes (now a formal committee and not a subcommittee), meeting weekly, and members have been assigned designated roles. They are concurrently working on the fundraising plan and working with playground companies on how to use the space and what the new playground will look like.

The Committee is beginning to hear from the community now. The scope of the project is a new playground (the current one likely cannot be refurbished), with a strong request from the school to have an outdoor classroom space that can be used regularly and has some flexibility. The third request is for turf or a grassy area so that students can play sports during recess as Spaulding Field is too far away.

Multigenerational use is also a consideration and that might include a path around the playground for laps while children are playing, possibly include better tables for board games, and new ways to expand the use.

Discussions are under way with a few companies to provide proposals for a master plan of the space. Restrictions, conservation concerns, and boundaries have been discussed. The plaza blacktop may also be reduced in size. Once the Committee has a master plan, they will come back to the Commission to provide an update.

The community wants a similar style playground - a replica which is big and labyrinthine with lots of nooks and crannies. The Community values the trees and seems aligned with the potential vision of what the playground should be. The companies the Committee are working with specialize in these types of structures.

Funding may include sponsorship of playground parts (e.g., pavers) by the community and/or corporations, or there may be some sort of fundraising tiers. Jenn is looking at different grant options.

The new playground is likely to be built in the summer of 2023 and it may be executed in a phased approach. A Master Plan will help determine how to best use the space. There are no reported issues with water on the property, but the health of the trees will need to be addressed.

**7:15 pm**

**11 East Street – Ted Van Valey and Shelley Dweck - Discussion of new lighting for front entrance – Required condition of Certificate 2020-01.**

Ted Van Valey presented new photographs of the house (arial view, distance, and front door) and spec sheets for three types of wall mounted lanterns. Keller asked if anyone had any questions or comments about the proposed sconces.

The homeowners stated their preference for the Fresno Framed Medium Sconces which was their original choice.

Chip Dewing opined about whether the Committee should advise residents to use materials of the period or “of our time”. He felt that the Fresno sconces were of our time and mentioned that these fixtures have been used in other applications. He also felt that if it was appropriately detailed, designed, sized and reminiscent of a box lantern (which this is) then it was appropriate. The concern is that is it too modern? Chip stated that it is a tradeoff with phoney antique and felt that this was a transitional style and not too modern. Given its distance and location it was well suited for that pilaster adjacent to the doors and does not compete with it.

Kathy asked the members for comments. Jack stated that his preference was for something more traditional but had not looked at any samples. He felt this was a streamlined version of a barn lantern.

Ed’s preference was the Fresno and felt that any choice would not be highly visible due to the distance from the house to the road (which is approximately 220 feet.)

Annette’s preference was for the Bromley and Kathy agreed stating that it was contemporary but referenced a period look.

Ted commented that the house was built in 1989 and is not an old house. A discussion ensued about the length of the sconces and Kathy roughly sketched it on the photograph for all to view. The members also discussed the width of the sconce to the pilaster. All members agreed to eliminate the Bingham model as a choice. Ultimately, the members agreed to allow the homeowners to choose which model they preferred – either the Fresno or the Bromley model.

Kathy asked the homeowners to let her know asap which model they were choosing so that it could be recorded in the minutes.

**7:30 pm**

**Hearing 2021-03 for Certificate of Appropriateness – Julie MacQueen – 43-45 Bedford Road.  
Public Hearing Notice.**

Kathy presented color photos of the front elevation of the house that she had taken. Julie noted that all windows visible from a public way will be replaced.

Chip asked if Julie's intention was to put in the same look; Julie responded that she wanted to copy what her neighbor installed at 21-23 Bedford (Marvin 6/1 lights). Kathy asked if Julie considered doing something similar in style to what she currently has; Julie responded no due to the variety of window styles of the house. Keller mentioned that the house has 9/6, 6/9, 2/2, and other single light windows in the house. She felt that this gave the house charm and represented changes to the house over a long period of time. Julie stated that were she to copy the existing styles it would be very costly as they would be special-order windows.

Jack asked if the lights were true divided lights; Chip responded that they are simulated divided lights (SDL). Kathy asked that SDL be defined for the members. Chip explained that the lights are double paned and the muntins are applied to the surface of the glass. A spacer bar is located between the two panes of glass. Chip mentioned that this is the industry standard now.

The windows are pre-painted black with a clad exterior and painted inside. Chip noted that the color black was used extensively over several centuries and that every historic district he has worked in accepts them. He feels that that that is an acceptable option for this house.

Kathy and Annette discussed the profound changes these new windows would bring to the house and noted that a lot of the authenticity of the house would be lost with the new roof, a change in the style of windows, siding, and trim. Kathy noted that windows are an important character-defining feature of Julie's house. She felt that the house will look more generic, rather than historic, when all these changes have been finalized and asked Julie if she had considered that outcome.

Annette noted that we would like to preserve some of the history of the house and suggested that Julie walk around the district to get a sense of the cohesiveness of the district.

Kathy also asked if Julie had considered choosing one style of window throughout as a compromise, such as 9/6 of 6/6 lights rather than 6/1 lights. Julie responded that she would ask for a quote from her vendor the following day and would compare costs. Kathy said that that would be worth investigating and that the Commission was aware of her tight timeline to get products ordered in time for her scheduled installation in September.

Jack discussed the operability of the different models. Chip noted that the overall appearance changes with black sashes and that the configuration of the lights becomes less important as the overall appearance will appear black. Chip asked for the new specs for the Commission's review.

Julie agreed to ask for additional quotes for 9/6 and 6/6 lights to determine the price differential and agreed to respond to the Commission in the next day or two.

Jack raised the issue of whether the windows were replacement windows and noted that the dimensions of the sills are important in old houses.

Chip reviewed the quote and stated that the windows were a complete replacement package with no casings and no sills.

Julie remembered that her contractor stated he would replace the sills as needed. Ed noted that any damaged sills needed to be replaced in kind as that is part of the window condition.

Julie mentioned that the muntins and sash color will be black and the sills and trim will be white.

Chip mentioned that with her color siding there will be modulation between sashes and trim. It will be a closer match to her house now.

Kathy asked for the new information to be in written form for the Commission to review and stated the Commission would hold a short meeting soon after to vote on the CofA.

The discussion turned next to siding. In the previous meeting Geoff said the siding standard was 4" exposure. Chip felt that the window trim should be slightly narrower at 3.5" and that that size was standard stock size. The corner boards and rakes should be 1" thick nominally x 6" wide nominally (3.25" x 5.5"). The rest of the trim will be 1" x 4". Doors should be the same size trim as the windows.

Kathy reviewed the specs and stated that the grey/blue color of the siding is very close to the original paint color, the surface will be smooth and not simulated, and the siding material is cement not clapboard. Chip was concerned about the glossiness of the finished product. It seems to have a little more sheen than clapboards. Chip suggested that Julie may want to see if a matte finish is also available.

It was agreed that the longest length for a continuous run of siding is 144", the shortest length for a continuous run should be 48" at a minimum. The joints will be staggered every third course at a minimum in vertical alignment.

Chip suggested the trim be Hardie board. Arctic White is the only color available. Chip noted that the nails will be face nails in a painted trim and therefore more visible than the blind nailing of clapboards.

Finally, Julie noted that she really appreciated the Commission's thoughtfulness, guidance and understanding of her project.

### **Admin Updates**

The Commission was contacted by a prospective candidate to fill the alternate vacancy position. Annette and Kathy will try to meet with her next week to discuss her interest.

Fern's – gravel was laid at the backyard and picnic tables installed there and in front of the store. Ed suggested that this may be a historic preservation issue as it is visible from a public way. It may also be a zoning issue which may require a conversation with the Building Commissioner re Fern's permit.

Kathy forwarded an email update on 21-23 Bedford provided by Eric Adams for the Commission's review. Kathy will re-send it or send the photos as attachments.

Landscaping will begin on the front side of the building at 21-23 Bedford Rd. and the interior will be insulated. The driveway is being installed from the street up to the barn entrance.

The historic district booklets were distributed to the members present and to Allison Casazza. Kathy explained that this booklet was funded with CPA monies as a tool for the Commission.

Kathy also discussed ways that the Commission's website page could be developed with further information for residents, such as an annual update on Carlisle's CPA funding levels.

### **Adjournment**

A motion was made by Annette to adjourn the meeting at 8:59 pm. Ed seconded the motion, and all approved. The motion was carried.

*Next Meeting:* July 21, 2021

**Documents submitted or attached:**

*School Committee:* Playground proposal with photos

*Dweck and Van Valey:*

Spec Sheets:

**Visual Comfort** - Fresno Framed Medium Sconce. Finish -AI (black).  
Item # CHD 2933A1-CG. Designer Chapman & Myers.

**Hinkley** - Bromley Small Wall Mount Lantern. Finish - Museum Black. Item # 2360MB.

**Hinkley** – Bingham Small Wall Mount Lantern. Finish – Sienna. Item # - 2360MB.

**Three photos of the house** – aerial view, distance view, front door

*Julie MacQueen:*

Color photos of house and garage front elevation.

MacLeod & Moynihan Window & Door quote for Marvin Windows.

James Hardie building products catalog(s); shingle and trim samples.